

Solution. The problem is from [1] and inspired also by recent computations by Mark Rickert. Part (b) was solved by Joseph DeVincentis and Dan Dima (both found that $s\text{Inverse}(4)$ has 111 elements, working entirely by hand). Stephen Meskin proved that $s\text{Inverse}(4)$ is finite. Mark Rickert has computed $s(n)$ for n up to 8,000,000. The sequence begins as follows, for n from 1 to 50:

0,2,4,3,5,4,6,3,6,5,6,4,6,4,4,4,6,4,7,4,4,5,6,4,8,4,6,4,7,4,6,5,7,6,4,4,7,6,4,4,7,4,5,5,4,5,6,4,6,5

I have posted Rickert's data at <http://stanwagon.com/public/1340RickertData.txt> . These stabilizing lengths are remarkably small: 17 is the largest $s(n)$ for $n \leq 8,000,000$. This table shows the tallies of the s -values. Note the single occurrence of ∞ ! The 111 is the correct total count for 4 (and the smaller values are correct too). The later entries will continue to grow as n rises:

$s(n)$	frequency
0	1
2	1
3	2
4	111
5	268820
6	1311460
7	3398966
8	2275437
9	614110
10	106868
11	18841
12	4234
13	895
14	187
15	56
16	9
17	1
∞	1

As found in [1], there appears to be only one value for which $s(n)$ does not become constant, and that is 1969. That was not known in 1969, as it was discovered only in 1993. For $n = 1969$ the matrix looks like this below: each row is a column of the modular Ackermann matrix, and only the initial 15 entries of each column are shown. A minor miracle happens in that $A(5,2)$, a gigantic number, turns out to be divisible by 1969. This explains the first 0 that occurs below. It migrates to the (7,0) position and then the miracle of period 3 occurs. And the column after that then becomes 1698,0,0,... which generates 0, 1698, 0, 1698 and these two alternate forever.

column 0: {1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12,13,14,15}

column 1: {2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10,11,12,13,14,15,16}
 column 2: {3,5,7,9,11,13,15,17,19,21,23,25,27,29,31}
 column 3: {5,13,29,61,125,253,509,1021,76,155,313,629,1261,556,1115}
 column 4: {13,556,1774,1720,1303,1392,392,194,1247,1087,152,1470,1424,1258,1440}
 column 5: {556,1698,0,13,1258,1698,0,13,1258,1698,0,13,1258,1698,0}
 column 6: {1698,0,556,1258,0,556,1258,0,556,1258,0,556,1258,0,556}
 column 7: {0,1698,1258,0,1698,1258,0,1698,1258,0,1698,1258,0,1698,1258}
 column 8: {1698,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0}
 column 9: {0,1698,0,1698,0,1698,0,1698,0,1698,0,1698,0,1698,0}
 column 10: {1698,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0,0}

So this shows that 1969 does not lead to a constant column, but rather to two alternating columns. This is the only known value that does not lead to a constant column

As for part (b), here is Dima's solution: Let $s(n)$ be the column index of the first constant column. The initial columns of the Ackermann function are $y+1$, $y+2$, $2y+3$, $2^{y+3}-3$. Therefore

$$\begin{aligned}
 B(n,0,y) &= \text{mod}(y+1, n), \quad B(n,1,y) = \text{mod}(y+2, n), \\
 B(n,2,y) &= \text{mod}(2y+3, n), \quad \text{and } B(n,3,y) = \text{mod}(2^{y+3}-3, n)
 \end{aligned}$$

Hence for $n > 13$: $B(n,3,0) = 5$, $B(n,3,1) = 13$. And then $B(n,4,0) = B(n,3,1) = 13$ and $B(n,4,1) = B(n,3, B(n,4,0)) = B(n,3,13)$.

$$B(n,3,13) = \text{mod}(2^{16}-3, n) = \text{mod}(65533, n)$$

It follows that for any n larger than 65333, $B(n,4,1) = 65333$ and $B(n,4,0) = 13$, so the column is not constant. Therefore if $s(n) = 4$, n is at most 65333, proving that $\text{slinverse}(4)$ is finite. At this point computation will get the requested set, but it can be done by hand as follows.

Consider first $\text{slinverse}(k)$ for $k = 0, 1, 2, 3$:

$s(n) = 0$ only when $n=1$, because $B(n,0,y) = \text{mod}(y+1, n)$

$s(n) \neq 1$ for any n because the first two entries in column 1 are $(0,1)$ for $n = 2$, $(2,0)$ for $n = 3$, and $(2,3)$ for any larger n .

$s(n) = 2$ only when $n=2$. The first two entries in column 2 as n rises from 2 are **(1,1)**, $(0,2)$, $(3,1)$, $\{3,0\}$, $\{3,5\}$, $\{3,5\}$, $\{3,5\}$,...

$s(n) = 3$ only when $n=4$ or 8. The first two entries in column 2 as n rises from 2 are

$(1,1)$, $(2,1)$, **(1,1)**, $(0,3)$, $(5,1)$, $(5,6)$, **(5,5)**, $(5,4)$, $(5,3)$, $(5,2)$, $(5,1)$, $(5,0)$, $(5,13)$, $(5,13)$, $(5,13)$, $(5,13)$,...

But let's analyze this another way,.

If $s(n) = 3$ then column 3 is constant so we have $B(n,3,0) = B(n,3,1)$ (and this is sufficient for constancy).

But $A(n,3,0)=5$ and $A(n,3,1)=13$; so $\text{mod}(13, n) = \text{mod}(5, n)$, so $5 \equiv 13 \pmod{n}$ and that happens only for $n = 1, 2, 4$ and 8 . But for 1 and 2 , stabilization occurs earlier. So the set is $\{4, 8\}$.

The preceding analysis works for $s(n) = 4$. We would need: $B(n,4,0) = B(n,4,1)$. When $n \geq 14$ this is the same as $13 \equiv 65533 \pmod{n}$. This is simply asking for the divisors of 65520 that are ≥ 14 ; there are 108 of them. For $n \leq 13$, and $n \neq 1, 2, 4$, or 8 , one can check that the values $3, 6, 12$ are the ones that work. So the total count is $108+3=111$ and the set $S\text{Inverse}[4]$ consists of the divisors of 65520 except for $1, 2, 4, 8, 5, 7, 9, 10, 13$. QED

Source: Source. Jon Froemke and Jerrold Grossman, Amer Math Monthly, 180, February 1993, 180-183.